

	REPORT TO CABINET TO BE HELD ON 14 JUNE 2016				
	<table> <tr> <td>Key Decision</td> <td>No</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Forward Plan Ref No</td> <td>25</td> </tr> </table>	Key Decision	No	Forward Plan Ref No	25
Key Decision	No				
Forward Plan Ref No	25				
Corporate Priority Place – to protect and improve our environment, now and for the future.	<table> <tr> <td>Cabinet Portfolio Holder</td> <td>Councillor J Plant</td> </tr> </table>	Cabinet Portfolio Holder	Councillor J Plant		
Cabinet Portfolio Holder	Councillor J Plant				

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR (NE) – 16/130

WARDS AFFECTED: WHITBY WEST CLIFF

SUBJECT: REINSTATEMENT OF EDWARDIAN SHELTERS, WEST CLIFF, WHITBY

RECOMMENDATION (S):

Cabinet is recommended to:

- (i) approve the construction of two replacement Edwardian shelters on West Cliff Whitby in accordance with the plans attached as Appendices 2 and 3;
- (ii) note that a budget of up to £80,000 for the replacement of the two shelters was approved as part of the Financial Strategy in February 2016;
- (iii) note that the architect that has drawn the plans for the replacement will be retained to obtain listed building consent for the two replacement shelters;
- (iv) authorise Officers to tender for the works to construct the two replacement shelters;
- (v) subject to listed building consent being granted and the costings being within budget delegate authority to the Director (NE) in consultation with the Portfolio Holder for Strategic Planning and Transformation to enter into contract with the successful contractor(s) following the tender exercise;

- (vi) authorise any surplus budget to be used to paint the external of the Whitby Cliff Lift top station and the third West Cliff shelter to ensure they are within keeping with the two new shelters.

REASON FOR RECOMMENDATION (S):

- To obtain the support of Cabinet to re-construct the two historic shelters that suffered storm damage.
- To obtain authority to undertake the works required in terms of obtaining listed building consent and construction costs.
- To provide structurally improved and visually enhanced shelters for this popular area.
- To enhance the street scene in this location.

HIGHLIGHTED RISKS:

- (i) Listed Building Consent is not granted for the re-construction of the shelters.
- (ii) Tendered costs to reconstruct the shelters exceed the indicative costs.
- (iii) No contractors return a tender for the works.
- (iv) Inclement weather during the construction of the shelters on-site may cause delay.

1. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 During the night of 21st November 2015 high winds caused damage to the three Grade II listed shelters located on the West Cliff, Whitby.
- 1.2 Two single storey Edwardian shelters; one situated 15 metres to the East of the Cliff Lift and the other situated 15 metres to the West were completely destroyed during the storm.
- 1.3 The shelters were blown into the adopted highway adjacent to the West Cliff and following the tidy-up all the salvageable timbers and cast iron brackets were removed to the Council's Dean Road depot for safe keeping and potential incorporation in any new replacement shelters.
- 1.4 The third shelter, an Art Nouveau shelter situated 30 metres to the West of the Cliff Lift, suffered damage to one of the seaward side roof aspects. This aspect has been repaired.

2. CORPORATE OBJECTIVES AND THE COMMUNITY PLAN

- 2.1 The re-construction of the two shelters will comply with the “place” agenda of the Corporate Plan - well maintained open spaces, with high quality development.

3. BACKGROUND AND ISSUES

- 3.1 The shelters are located on the West Cliff, Whitby which is a popular area for both residents and tourists.
- 3.2 The two damaged shelters were both Grade II listed, and the listing describes them as:

‘Shelter or covered seat. c1900, restored late C20. Wood and cast iron, with hipped shingle roof. Six turned wooden columns with ornate iron brackets, each with iron rosette finials, support wooden panelled ceiling and hipped roof clad in wooden shingles. Similar curved cast iron brackets at base of each column and between wooden framed structure with lower plank divisions and curved slatted benches between. Ends have ornate cast iron brackets which support simple projecting plank benches’.

- 3.3 The shelters originally had a lead roof, ornate ironmongery at fascia level and decorative cast iron finials at ridge level but have been adapted over many years to the condition described in the above listing. A plan of the shelters existing elevations is attached as Appendix 1.
- 3.4 The Council is seeking to re-construct the shelters based on the condition described in the listing whilst adding in some of the original ornamental ironmongery features.
- 3.5 Listed Building Consent is required prior to constructing the two replacement shelters, which can take up to three months to obtain.

4. CONSULTATION

- 4.1 The Portfolio Holder for Strategic Planning and Transformation has been consulted and is supportive of the proposal to replace the two historic shelters.
- 4.2 Officers have held discussions with the Planning Authority’s Conservation Officer regarding the approach to the design of the replacement shelters and have received support throughout the process.
- 4.3 Consultation has also taken place with the Council’s Engineers with regard to the re-construction of the shelters particularly around designing the structure against prevailing winds and weather conditions.

5. ASSESSMENT

- 5.1 Officers have carefully considered the re-design and construction of the two replacement shelters ensuring they can withstand wind loadings whilst incorporating some of the original timbers and cast iron features salvaged following the storm.
- 5.2 Following the storm Officers were successful in searching the archives and contacting local interest groups for information with regard to the original photographs and designs of the shelters; and remain grateful for the assistance received.
- 5.3 The Council appointed a local architect to review the original plans and photographs and in conjunction with a structural engineer determine where the weaknesses were in relation to the build of the original structure and the cause of its failure. Following structural assessment it was found that the timber post construction of the shelters failed due to wind loading.
- 5.4 Extensive discussions have taken place between the architect, the Planning Authority Conservation Officer and the Council's structural engineer to determine the most favourable approach to the shelters re-design and construction.
- 5.5 The Conservation Officer requested the incorporation of features salvaged from the original shelters, and the shelters have been designed to incorporate cast iron brackets, rosette finials and original timber boarding and seat.
- 5.6 The design of the new timber shelters will incorporate a circular hollow section column with a square hollow section cross beam clad in timber to replicate the original timber post design and to withstand the imposed wind loadings. The structure will be secured to the concrete plinth via a base plate which helps to spread the load of the shelter. The plans for the proposed construction (Appendix 2) and proposed cladding (Appendix 3) are attached.
- 5.7 The budget approved as part of the Financial Strategy in February 2016 covered the cost of obtaining planning consent, tendering the contracts, construction and project management. Based on the indicative costings drawn up the two shelters can be replaced with that budget figure of £80,000.
- 5.8 Subject to Cabinet approval the next stage is to commission the architect to obtain listed building consent to construct the two replacement shelters.
- 5.9 At the same time as the planning consent is being obtained Officers will, in accordance with the Council's Constitution, conduct a tender exercise for the construction and installation of the shelters.
- 5.10 A large proportion of the works can be completed off-site, with the on-site works best carried out in March 2017 when the weather is hopefully more hospitable.

- 5.11 To ensure that this aspect of the Whitby West Cliff looks resplendent it is hoped that there will be sufficient funds remaining from the budgeted figure to also paint the external of the nearby Cliff Lift top station and the third shelter (the Art Nouveau).

6. IMPLICATIONS

6.1 Policy

- 6.1.1 The proposal is in accordance with the Council's policy framework.

6.2 Financial Implications

- 6.2.1 Outlined in the body of the report.

6.3 Legal

- 6.3.1 The Council will prepare all the relevant legal documentation pertaining to the tender invitation documentation and appointment of the successful contractor.

6.4 Risk

- 6.4.1 Detailed in the attached Risk Matrix

6.5 Planning Implications

- 6.5.1 The architect will continue to engage with the Planning Authority during the listed building application process.

6.6 Environmental Implications

- 6.6.1 The new replacement shelters will be in keeping with the surrounding areas, and retain elements of the shelters original timber and cast iron features.
- 6.6.2 The replacement shelters will be a high quality build incorporating a steel sub-frame to minimise the risk of such an incident occurring again.

7. ACTION PLAN

- 7.1 The indicative timeline to construct the shelters is:

- Report to Cabinet 14 June 2016
- Confirm architect appointment 27 June 2016
- Submit listed building consent July 2016
- Planning Committee 6 October 2016
- Prepare tender documentation July 2016
- Receiving tender submissions 30 September 2016
- Planning Committee 6 October 2016
- Award contracts November 2016

- Commence construction off-site Dec 2016/Jan 2017
- Construction on site 6 March 2017
- Completion Easter 2017 7 April 2017

Nicholas Edwards

Nicholas Edwards
Director

Author: Martin Pedley, Town Hall, St Nicholas Street, Scarborough, YO11 2HG
Telephone No: 01723 232450
E-mail address: martin.pedley@scarborough.gov.uk

Risk Matrix

Risk Ref.	Date	Risk	Consequences	Mitigation	Current Risk Score	Target Score	Service Unit Manager/ Responsible Officer	Action Plan
1	June 2016	Cabinet does not agree to the reconstruction of the two shelters.	Impact on the vista and reduction in the number of historic landmarks Need to remove the two redundant concrete bases and re-instate the affected surrounding area	A budget was identified as part of the Financial Strategy in February 2016	A2	A2	Estates	This report to Cabinet seeking approval.
2	June 2016	Not securing a competitive cost to re-construct the two shelters.	Re-tender with alternative contractors or seek an increase in the budget Amend the specification of the shelter construction Do not reinstate the shelters	Officers have engaged with local market during design and budget estimating	A3	A2	Estates	Draft the tender documentation and work with local contractors
3	June 2016	The Council does not obtain Listed Building Consent for the replacement shelters.	Re-submit plans Increased costs to re-design and any additional architectural ironmongery	Designed in conjunction with the Council's Conservation Officer	A2	A2	Estates	
4	June 2016	Inclement weather during construction period.	The completion of the shelters may be delayed.	Large element of the works can be constructed off-site. On-site works expected to take place during March when weather less inhospitable.	B2	B2	Estates	