1.0 THE PROPOSAL

1.1 Town Farm is a former working farm in the centre of Cloughton, fronting onto the Eastern side of High Street. It lies between High Street and the former Scarborough to Whitby railway line. It comprised a range of traditional historic stone and pantile farm buildings; larger, more modern agricultural buildings (now demolished); smaller sheds; and, 3 existing houses (which lie outside the application site). Planning permission was granted last year for a redevelopment scheme involving 17 new build houses and 7 houses converted from existing buildings. The Committee considered the planning application some time ago, but planning permission was subject to a protracted legal agreement involving the transfer of land to accommodate an extension to Lindhead School.

1.2 The entire site is situated within the Cloughton Conservation Area. The existing farm cottage adjacent to the proposed access is a grade 2 listed building.

1.3 This application is to vary 3 of the conditions attached to the planning permission as follows:

Condition 1 Plans Clarification - To make minor material amendments to the siting and design of some of the buildings.

Condition 2 Construction Materials - To enable slate roofing instead of natural red clay pantiles to be used on a number of the proposed buildings. This proposal was amended late in the application process to allow the use of slate on one building and corrugated metal sheeting on 2 of the car port blocks.

Condition 6 Window and Door reveals - To reduce the minimum reveal on door and window frames from 100mm to 75mm.
2.0 SCREENING OPINION REQUIRED?

2.1 No

3.0 PRE-APPLICATION COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

3.1 None.

4.0 CONSULTATIONS AND COMMENTS

The following is a summary of the key and relevant comments received from consultees and interested parties. Their full comments and any accompanying documentation are available to view on the Council’s website.

4.1 Cloughton Parish Council - No objections. It was felt the changes are a considerable improvement on the approved plans and will result in dwellings whose appearance is more in keeping with the local vernacular.

4.2 Historic England - We understand that the current application seeks minor amendments regarding materials and details such as the position of rooflights and the depth of window reveals. We advise that these matters should be addressed to the satisfaction of your own Conservation Officer / expert conservation adviser. Historic England has no objection to the application on heritage grounds. In determining this application you should bear in mind the statutory duty to have special regard to the desirability of preserving listed buildings or their setting and to pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of conservation areas.

4.3 Publicity - Consultation period expired on 10 January 2018.

5.0 RELEVANT SITE HISTORY

5.1 2011 - This site formed part of a wider outline application to build 155 dwellings and other facilities on 4 sites in Cloughton. Outline planning permission refused on grounds of unsustainability and adverse impact on the character of the village and its Conservation Area.

5.2 2018 - Planning permission granted for erection of 24 dwellings comprising 7 conversions in existing retained farm buildings and 17 new build dwellings.

5.3 2018 - Listed Building Consent granted for partial demolition of wall to provide access to residential development.

6.0 PLANNING POLICY

6.1 Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 and Section 70(2) of The Town and Country Planning Act 1990 require that planning applications are determined in accordance with the Development Plan unless material considerations
indicate otherwise (in the case of advertisement applications the Advertisement Regulations 2007 are applicable). Attention is drawn to the following Development Plan and other planning policies and guidance which are considered to be particularly relevant to the consideration of this application:-

**Scarborough Borough Local Plan 2017**

- **DEC 1** - Principles of Good Design
- **DEC 4** - Protection of Amenity
- **DEC 5** - The Historic and Built Environment
- **ENV 7** - Landscape Protection and Sensitivity
- **INF 4** - Cinder Track (The Former Scarborough to Whitby Railway Line)

**National Planning Policy Framework**

- **NPPF7** - Requiring good design
- **NPPF12** - Conserving and enhancing the historic environment

**Scarborough Borough Supplementary Planning Documents**

None relevant

**Local Planning Policy and Guidance**

Cloughton Conservation Area Character and Management Proposals

7.0 **ASSESSMENT**

    **Condition 1**

7.1 The proposed revisions to the approved plans are considered to be relatively minor in nature. They include; very minor alterations to the position of some buildings to meet highway visibility requirements; changes to some carports and parking spaces; and changes to the fenestration of some buildings, such as alterations to the position and style of some doors, windows and roof lights, and the omission of breaks in the rooflines. Their need has arisen as the scheme has been further developed in the immediate pre-construction phase. As these are bespoke designs for this particular site, it was predictable that detailed design changes would be required as the scheme is reviewed by the developers with regard to construction.

7.2 Although there are a number of such changes, the development retains the same character and will appear little different to the casual observer, with the same form of buildings, mix of materials and architectural style being retained. Overall the changes do not have an adverse effect on the character and appearance of the development and the scheme will continue to preserve and enhance the character of the conservation area. There is considered to be no reduction in the quality of the scheme from that approved. As such it is considered that the amended proposal complies with policies **DEC 1** and **DEC 5** of the Local Plan concerning good design and protection of the historic environment respectively.
7.3 It is not considered that any of the proposed changes will adversely affect the amenities of existing neighbouring properties or those of future occupiers of the development and, therefore, continues to comply with Local Plan policy DEC 4 concerning the protection of amenity.

Condition 2

7.4 Planning condition 2 deals with construction materials and, amongst other things, requires that all roofs within the development to be clad in traditional red clay pantiles. The reason was to protect the character and appearance of the Cloughton Conservation Area. The applicants were seeking to use slate roofing tiles on seven of the buildings and a profiled steel sheet on one. However, following detailed discussions, the proposal has been revised to one slate roofed building, plot 24 in the north eastern corner of the site, and corrugated metal sheeting on 2 of the blocks of car ports.

7.5 The Cloughton Conservation Area Appraisal recognises that "the vast majority (of the stone buildings) are roofed in natural red clay pantiles (or the variant natural red clay 'celtic' tiles). Red clay pantiles are also widely used on brick buildings especially in Hay Lane Terrace and the West Lane. A small number of stone buildings are roofed in Welsh slate - and these tend to be significant buildings such as the former school, the Reading room, Cloughton Hall and Kirkstones. Of the modern dwellings, those erected in the last few years have tended to respect the tradition of stone walls and pantile roofs.... Future new development in the Conservation Area should respect the use of appropriate stone and natural clay pantiles." The Conservation Area appraisal also includes a helpful map which shows the distribution of building materials and illustrates the concentration of stone and pantile and sparse use of slate. This will be displayed at the meeting.

7.6 It is the combination of stone and pantile which, more than any other feature, gives the Conservation Area its identity and character. Conservation Area Management policy RMP7 requires that new development should be carried out in appropriate materials including stone walls under clay pantile roofs. Conservation Area Character Appraisals and Management Proposals have recently been given greater significance and weight by Local Plan policy DEC 5 which requires that; "Proposals affecting a Conservation Area should preserve or enhance its character or appearance especially those elements identified in any Conservation Area Appraisal" (my underlining).

7.7 The views of Cloughton from the former Scarborough to Whitby railway line strikingly feature the red pantile roof tops of the village rising gently towards the escarpment of the North York Moors beyond. Until their recent demolition, the more modern agricultural buildings of Town Farm were an alien, intrusive feature within this scene and one of the benefits of the redevelopment of the site was the removal of these incongruous buildings and their replacement with more sympathetic development which would enhance the appearance of the Conservation Area and setting of the village.

7.8 It is considered that the introduction of slate roofs into this setting would be inappropriate for a number of reasons:

They would be out of character with the Conservation Area and look out of place in this village.
Due to the size of the site, number of buildings originally proposed with slate roofs and proximity to and prominence of the site from the former railway line, the slate roofs would be obtrusive: and,

The styles of the new houses are based upon and designed to reflect the simple cottages and traditional farm buildings found in the village; these types of building are exclusively roofed in pantiles.

A patchwork of pantile and slate on one site would be completely alien from the remainder of the historic core of the village and would appear contrived.

7.9 Therefore, it is considered that the introduction of slate roofs into this development would seriously harm and fail to preserve or enhance the character of the Conservation Area and be contrary to the provisions of Local Plan policies DEC5, referred to above, and ENV7 which expects development proposals to protect and where possible enhance the distinctiveness or special features that contribute to the landscape character of a particular area and take account of the sensitivity of the landscape to change in terms of the relationship to existing settlement edges and the cultural pattern. Furthermore the policy states that proposals should avoid the loss of individual characteristics of settlements or harm to the wider landscape including the setting of the North York Moors National Park; that would occur with the extensive use of slate within this development. Local Plan Policy INF4 is concerned with the Cinder Track and states that proposals within its vicinity will have to demonstrate that they will not harm the character and amenity value of the route. It is considered that the extensive use of slate in such close proximity to the line would harm the attractive views of Cloughton from the footpath.

7.10 There is, perhaps, one exception on this site and that is plot 24 in the extreme North eastern corner of the site. This is a detached dwelling with a square floor plan and hipped roof, designed to reflect a traditional dovecote. As this is a grander building than others on the site, it is considered that a different, slate roof would not look out of place, nor would it change the overall character of the development and its contribution to the Conservation Area. It would also reflect the theme in the village of a small number of sporadic, landmark buildings having slate roofs.

7.11 Following detailed negotiations, the applicants have amended their proposals such that all of the buildings would now be roofed on red clay pantiles except plot 24, which would be roofed in slate and car port blocks C and D which it is proposed to roof in corrugated metal sheet. Subject to the colouring and profile, this is considered to be an acceptable idea on these smaller, lower open buildings and is designed to reflect the sheet roofed sheds often found within traditional farmyards. This quirky feature will add interest without harming the character and overall effect of the development when viewed in the context of its landscape setting and the wider Conservation Area. A plan showing the distribution of proposed roofing materials will be displayed at the meeting.

Condition 6

7.12 Historic buildings typically have their window and door frames set back from the outer face of the stone or brick work into the wall. This detail is known as a reveal and gives depth and quality to the appearance of buildings. Without out it, buildings can look rather flat and uninteresting, as though the windows and doors have been applied like a
roll of "wallpaper" onto the walls. It is a small but important detail. On stone buildings in this area it is not uncommon to find reveals as much as 200mm in depth. It is important that the depth of any reveal is sufficient to make the relief it offers to the building stand out. Condition 6 on the planning permission requires reveals of a minimum of 100mm. Conservation Area Management Plan Policy RM7 of the Cloughton Conservation Area appraisal requires that "Windows and doors should be constructed in painted timber with windows set in deep reveal". The applicants have explained that this will give them constructional difficulties as they will be building cavity walls with a natural stone facing on the new build properties which will not be wide enough to provide a 100mm reveal. In view of these practical difficulties it is considered that a 75mm reveal, whilst less than ideal, should be accepted in these circumstances. The overall quality of the appearance of the development will still remain high.

7.13 The conditions recommended below include those that remain relevant from the original planning permission as, if the proposed amendments are approved by Committee, the new consent will be a replacement for the original planning consent.

POSITIVE & PROACTIVE STATEMENT

The following steps were taken in an effort to achieve a positive outcome to this application.

Pre-application discussions took place about the proposed variations to conditions 1 and 6. Unfortunately there were no such discussions about the amendments to the roofing materials required by condition 2. The proposal as originally submitted was considered unacceptable, so the local planning authority gave the applicant the opportunity to amend or withdraw that aspect of the application.

RECOMMENDATION
PERMISSION BE GRANTED, subject to the following condition(s)

1 The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the following Plans:
   1131_EX10_02 Demolition Plan
   1131_AR10_01 Rev F Proposed Site Plan
   1131_AR50_01 Rev C Blocks A & B Proposed Plans & Elevations
   1131_AR50_02 Rev A Blocks C & D Proposed Plans & Elevations
   1131_AR50_03 Rev H Blocks E & J Proposed Plans & Elevations
   1131_AR50_04 Rev E Blocks F & G Proposed Plans & Elevations
   1131_AR50_05 Rev F Blocks H & I Proposed Plans & Elevations
   1131_AR50_06 Rev E Blocks K & L Proposed Plans & Elevations
   1131_AR50_07 Rev B Carports (sheet 1)
   1131_AR50_08 Rev A Carports (Sheet 2)
   Letter from Bramhall Blenkharn dated 18 January 2018 confirming roofing materials.

   Reason: To avoid doubt.

2 Before the construction of any external walls or laying of hard surfaces, a materials schedule for those elements, along with any samples which may subsequently be required, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the
Local Planning Authority. The development shall be constructed in accordance with the approved schedule and samples. The schedule shall make provision for all of the exterior walling to be in natural stone. Where timber cladding is shown on the approved plans, it shall be light in colour, predominantly vertically boarded and selected to reflect the Yorkshire boarding commonly used on agricultural buildings within the locality.

Reason: In order to protect the character and appearance of the Cloughton Conservation Area and in accordance with Policies DEC 1 and DEC 5 of the Scarborough Borough Local Plan.

Note: It is suggested that any samples of materials that are requested are delivered to site and the planning case officer is advised that they are available for inspection.

3 A one metre square freestanding panel of for each type of stonework proposed to be used in the construction of the development hereby permitted shall be constructed on site and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority before any of the walling commences. The panels shall include samples of the lintels and cills proposed to be used. All new stonework shall match that of the approved panel in terms of the type of stone used, the method of jointing, mortar colour and pointing style. The panel so constructed shall be retained on the site until the development hereby approved has been completed.

Reason: In order to protect the character and appearance of the Cloughton Conservation Area and in accordance with Policies DEC 1 and DEC 5 of the Scarborough Borough Local Plan.

4 The roofs of the buildings hereby approved shall be clad in accordance with the schedule set out in the letter from Bramhall Blenkharn to the Local Planning Authority dated 18 January 2018. Samples of each of the roofing materials shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority before roofing work commences on site. To avoid doubt the schedule in the letter dated 18 January 2018 supersedes the notation on the approved layout plan.

Reason: In order to protect the character and appearance of the Cloughton Conservation Area and in accordance with Policies DEC 1 and DEC 5 of the Scarborough Borough Local Plan.

5 A Sample of each type of window frame to be used in the development hereby permitted shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority before first installation of any window frame and all of the framing used in the development shall conform to the samples so approved.

Reason: In order to protect the character and appearance of the Cloughton Conservation Area and in accordance with Policies DEC 1 and DEC 5 of the Scarborough Borough Local Plan.

6 Prior to first installation of any external door, including any garage doors, details of each type of external door and garage door shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority and all of the exterior doors used in the development shall conform to the details so approved.
Reason: In order to protect the character and appearance of the Cloughton Conservation Area and in accordance with Policies Dec 1 and DEC 5 of the Scarborough Borough Local Plan.

7 The external face of the frame to all new windows and doors shall be set in a reveal of a minimum of 75mm from the front face of the adjacent walling and thereafter be so maintained.

Reason: In order to protect the character and appearance of the Cloughton Conservation Area and in accordance with Policies Dec 1 and DEC 5 of the Scarborough Borough Local Plan.

8 The rainwater goods utilised in the development hereby permitted shall be coloured black and have a round profile and thereafter so maintained. The shall be mounted directly to the wall with gutter spikes. Fascias and barge boards shall not be used in the construction of the dwellings hereby approved.

Reason: In order to protect the character and appearance of the Cloughton Conservation Area and in accordance with Policies Dec 1 and DEC 5 of the Scarborough Borough Local Plan.

9 Details of all boundary treatments, to the site as a whole and to individual plots shall be submitted to and approve in writing before the development commences. All boundary treatments and other means of enclosure shall be erected before the first occupation of the dwelling to which a particular boundary relates.

Reason: In order to protect the character and appearance of the Cloughton Conservation Area and the amenities of existing and future residents in accordance with Policies DEC 1, DEC 4 and DEC 5 of the Scarborough Borough Local Plan.

10 Before the development commences detailed proposals for the closure of the existing access from the A171, High Street to the courtyard to vehicles shall be submitted and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The access shall be closed off in accordance with the approved details prior to the first occupation of the site.

Reason: In order to protect the character and appearance of the Cloughton Conservation Area and in accordance with Policies Dec 1 and DEC 5 of the Scarborough Borough Local Plan and in the interests of highway safety doe to the lack of visibility from this access.

11 Before any development is commenced, the approval of the Local Planning Authority is required to a scheme of landscaping and tree planting for the site indicating, inter alia, the number, species, heights on planting and positions of all the trees, together with details of post-planting maintenance. Such scheme as is approved by the Local Planning Authority shall be carried out in its entirety prior to the occupation of the last dwelling. All trees, shrubs and bushes shall be maintained by the owner or owners of the land on which they are situated for the period of five years beginning with the date of completion of the scheme and during that period all losses shall be made good as and when necessary.
Reason: In order to protect the character and appearance of the Cloughton Conservation Area and in accordance with Policies Dec 1 and DEC 5 of the Scarborough Borough Local Plan.

12 Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town & Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (England) Order 2015, (or any Order or Statutory Instrument, amending revoking and re-enacting that Order), none of the following developments or alterations shall be carried out without the prior written approval of the Local Planning Authority:
(i) the erection of freestanding curtilage buildings or structures including car ports, garages, sheds, greenhouses, pergolas or raised decks;
(ii) the erection of house extensions including dormer windows, conservatories, garages, car ports, porches or pergolas;
(iii) alterations including the installation of replacement or additional windows or doors and the installation of roof windows;
(iv) the erection of walls, fences or other means of enclosure.

Reason: In order to protect the special character of this part of the Cloughton Conservation Area this development has been carefully designed with bespoke dwelling units designed to reflect the agricultural heritage of the site in a tight layout. The uncontrolled extension, alteration and provision of curtilage structures and enclosures could seriously harm the special historic character of the Conservation Area and harm the amenities of the neighbours.

13 Prior to the commencement of the development details of the crime prevention and security measures that will be incorporated into the development shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of community safety and to discharge the Planning Authority's obligations under Section 17 of the Crime and Disorder Act.

14 No demolition or other development shall commence until a written scheme of archaeological investigation has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The scheme shall include an assessment of significance and research questions; and:
(i) The programme and methodology of site investigation and recording.
(ii) The programme for post investigation assessment.
(iii) Provision to be made for analysis of the site investigation and recording.
(iv) Provision be made for publication and dissemination of the analysis and records of the site investigation
(v) Provision be made for archive deposition of the analysis and records of the site investigation.
(vi) Nomination of a competent person, persons or organisation to undertake the works set out within the written scheme of investigation.

No demolition or development shall take place other than in accordance with the approved written scheme of investigation. The development shall not be occupied until the site investigation and post investigation assessment has been completed in accordance with the approved written scheme of investigation and provision made for analysis, publication and dissemination of results and archive deposition has been secured.
Reason: In accordance with Section 12 of the NPPF as the site is of archaeological interest.

David Walker

Background Papers:

Those documents referred to in this report.

IF YOU HAVE ANY QUERIES ABOUT THIS REPORT OR WISH TO INSPECT ANY OF THE BACKGROUND PAPERS, PLEASE CONTACT MR N READ ON 01723 232483 email nick.read@scarborough.gov.uk